**2023 Clara Bliss Hinds Society Mentorship Award Scoring Rubric**

Aims of CBH society on website:

* Facilitate career & leadership skill development; mentoring; and networking
* Enhance the work environment for women
* Promote equity in promotion, tenure, and recognition

Description of award:

* Exceptional mentorship of female students, residents, fellows and/or faculty
* Demonstrates positive impact on mentees
* Demonstrates commitment to advancement of female students, residents, fellows, and/or faculty

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Criteria** | **0-3 Developing**  **\*limited to no evidence\*** | **4-6 Accomplished**  **\*supporting, limited evidence\*** | **7-10 Exceptional**  **\*specific impacts and outcomes\*** |
| 1. Evidence of positive impact on mentees, such as evidence that the nominee has facilitated (1) career & leadership skill development; (2) mentoring; and (3) networking   Examples for any:   * career and leadership skill development (e.g., programs, workshops, etc.) * Networking opportunities that this nominee has facilitated * Mentoring opportunities * Trainee/colleague narratives | Minimal evidence of positive impact on mentees in 1) career & leadership skill development; (2) mentoring; and (3) networking   * Only one of the above areas is addressed (e.g., networking but not mentoring or career/leadership development) * General examples without clear outcomes or evidence * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted not discussed * Ex: *“Dr. X has had a positive impact on career and leadership development”* | Growing evidence of positive impact on mentees in 1) career & leadership skill development; (2) mentoring; and (3) networking   * Two of three areas addressed * Supporting but limited evidence provided * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted specified, but may be vague * Identification of efforts in 1-3, but concrete examples may be missing * Ex: *“Dr. X has positively impacted career development for 10 surgical trainees in the past 2 years in research.* | Substantial evidence of positive impact in 1) career & leadership skill development; (2) mentoring; and (3) networking   * All areas addressed * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted specified * Concrete examples and outcomes that the nominee has facilitated for 1-3 for trainees/colleagues * Ex: *“As a research mentor, Dr. X’s positive mentoring is recognized through 5 mentee-authored publications and 10 mentee abstracts”* |
| 1. Evidence that the nominee has enhanced the work environment for women (this could be in their department, division, lab, team, professional society, institution, or other)   Examples of supporting evidence for any:   * Programs, policies, actions, opportunities to improve the environment and/work life balance * Advocacy efforts for flexible work environments * Trainee/colleague narratives | Minimal evidence that nominee has enhanced work environment   * General examples without clear outcomes or evidence * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted not discussed * Ex: *“Dr X has enhanced the work environment for women”* | Growing evidence that the nominee has enhanced the work environment for women   * Supporting but limited evidence provided * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted specified, but may be vague * Identification programs or advocacy efforts, but impact missing * Ex: *“Dr X has enhanced the work environment through advocating for flexible work schedules”* | Substantial evidence that the nominee has enhanced the work environment for women   * Concrete examples and outcomes * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted specified * Ex: *“Through their advocacy for flexible work environments, all 8 assistant professors surveyed reported increased work satisfaction.*” |
| 1. Evidence that the nominee has worked to promote equity in 1) promotion and tenure, and 2) recognition   Examples of supporting for any:   * Awards and/or other recognition developed. * Trainees and faculty supported for P&T and/or trainee progress (dissertation committees, etc.) * External service for P&T and recognition (letters, committees) * Trainee/colleague narratives | Minimal evidence that nominee has worked to promote equity in (1) promotion and tenure and (2) recognition   * General examples without clear outcomes or evidence * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted not discussed * Ex: *“Dr. X has promoted equity promotion and tenur*e.” | Growing evidence that nominee has worked to worked promote equity in (1) promotion and tenure and (2) recognition   * One area addressed * Supporting but limited evidence provided * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted specified, but may be vague * Identification of evidence but impact not specified * Ex: *“Dr. X has promoted equity in P&T by serving as the chair of the departmental APT committee.”* | Substantial evidence that nominee has worked to promote equity in (1) promotion, tenure, and (2) recognition   * Both areas addressed * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted specified * Concrete examples and outcomes that the nominee has facilitated * Ex: *“As chair of the departmental APT committee, Dr. X supported the promotion of 4 female faculty from assistant to associate professor”* |
| 1. Evidence that the nominee demonstrates commitment to advancement of female students, residents, fellows, and/or faculty   Examples of supporting for any:   * Roles in mentoring committees * Roles in sponsorship * Trainee/colleague narratives | Minimal evidence that nominee demonstrates commitment to advancement of female students, residents, fellows, and/or faculty   * General examples without clear outcomes or evidence * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted not discussed * Ex: *“Dr X has helped advance female faculty GW.”* | Growing evidence that the nominee demonstrates commitment to advancement of female students, residents, fellows, and/or faculty   * Supporting but limited evidence provided * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted specified, but may be vague * Identification of evidence but impact not specified * Ex. *“Dr. X has served as a mentor for 4 female faculty in the department.”* | Substantial evidence that nominee demonstrates commitment advancement of female students, residents, fellows, and/or faculty   * Concrete examples and outcomes * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted specified * Ex: *“As their role as a mentor for 4 female faculty, Dr. X was critical in improving their teaching by providing …”* |
| 1. Evidence that the nominee demonstrates leadership and/or innovation in mentorship   Examples of supporting for any:   * Programs developed * New approaches in mentoring * Leadership roles in committees * Trainee/colleague narratives | Minimal evidence that nominee demonstrates leadership and/or innovation in mentorship   * General examples without clear outcomes or evidence * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted not discussed * Ex: *“Dr X has helped advance female faculty GW.”* | Growing evidence that the nominee has enhanced the work environment for women   * Supporting but limited evidence provided * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted specified, but may be vague * Identification of evidence but impact not specified * Ex: *“Dr X chaired the mentoring committees for 4 female faculty within the department.”* | Substantial evidence that nominee demonstrates commitment advancement of female students, residents, fellows, and/or faculty   * Concrete examples and outcomes * Number/names/categories of mentees impacted specified * Ex: “*As chair of the mentoring committee for 4 female faculty, Dr. X developed new guidelines for mentee/mentors …*” |